

Title	A Discourse Analysis of the Until-clause Construction
Author	Kinugasa, Tadashi
Citation	STUDIES IN THE HUMANITIES. Vol.60, pp.164-185.
Issue Date	2009-03
ISSN	0491-3329
Type	Departmental Bulletin Paper
Textversion	Publisher
Publisher	大阪市立大学大学院文学研究科
Description	Dedicated to Professor Yamano Masahiko, Professor Nakajima Hiroko, Professor Pierre Lavelle

Placed on: Osaka City University Repository

A Discourse Analysis of the *Until*-clause Construction

KINUGASA Tadashi

In this paper, the focus lies on discovering what kind of difference of meaning the *until*-clause has in relation to the progressive form. The *until*-clause with the progressive form means two types of time : (i) *not...until* type : something happens during a short period of time, and it is used when we regret the timing is rather late. (ii) *wait until* type : wait for the right period of time to come. And the *until*-clause including the progressive form also means two types of result : unintentional or intentional result. As for the main clause including the progressive form, the *until*-clause means time (there occurred some happening) or (unintentional) result (the ultimate point of the main clause). The typical pattern of this construction is that *everything is going well/smoothly until....* The S_1 *until* S_2 pattern without the progressive form in either S_1 or S_2 also means time and (unintentional or intentional) result. When the pattern means result, the subject of the main clause does something (and accomplishes it), and the next situation follows, but the *until*-clause including the progressive form does something for the purpose of doing it to the ultimate degree or the intended point and the resulting situation continues for a while. *Wait until...* construction again means 'to wait for the right time to do something.'

1. Introduction

The usage of *until*-clause is superficially easy for learners of English to understand, but actually it is not so easy. When we consult *Collins COBUILD English Dictionary for Advanced Learners*, we find two definitions for the *until*-clause.

- (1) If something happens until a particular time, it happens during the period before that time and stops at that time. *Until 1971, he was a high-ranking official in the Central Committee./consumers who have waited until after the Christmas holiday to do that holiday shopping/I waited until it got dark./Stir with a metal spoon until the sugar has dissolved.*
- (2) You use *until* with a negative to emphasize the moment in time after which the rest of your statement becomes true, or the condition which would make it true.

The traffic laws don't take effect until the end of the year./It was not until 1911 that the first of the vitamins was identified./The EC will not lift its sanctions until that country makes political changes.

The dictionary tells us general basic meanings, but we cannot know why example 3c or 3d is marginally or hardly acceptable. For example, the subject in 3c was dancing until the time of the music stopping, so from the dictionary definition of 1, example 3c seems to be perfectly acceptable, but it isn't so.

- (3) a. Alex danced *until* the music stopped.
 b. Alex kept dancing *until* the music stopped.
 c. (?) Alex was dancing *until* the music stopped.
 d. ?*Alex danced *until* the music was stopping. (Kittredge 1969 : 45-56)

Learners of English tend to use the *until*-clause at random because we do not know the delicate nuance lying there. And it is particularly difficult to understand whether it is acceptable when the main clause or the *until*-clause includes the progressive form. In this paper, the focus lies on discovering what kind of difference of meaning the *until*-clause has in relation to the progressive form, and knowledge about it could help learners to understand how to use the *until*-clause.

2. Traditional information

Quirk et al. (1985 : 1080) say that the three words *until*, *till*, and *before* indicate that the situation in the main clause occurred before or leading up to the situation in the subordinate clause. *Until* marks the time up to which the situation in the main clause applies. This is exemplified in 4a and 4b below.

- (4) a. I disliked Maurice until I got to know him.
 b. The children were noisy *until* told to be quiet. (Quirk et al. 1985 : 1081)

They also state that the main clause need not be durative in the *before*-clause construction as in 5a, while the main clause must be durative in the *until*-clause construction, the durative lasting to the time indicated by the *until*-clause, and a negative clause is always

durative, even though the corresponding positive clause is not durative, since the absence of the event extends throughout the indicated period. Examples 5b and 5c demonstrate the durative features, whereas example 5d becomes unacceptable due to the clash between the word 'started' and the durative feature of the main clause followed by the *until*-clause. They add that the *until*-clause may imply result as well as time. The *until*-clause expresses the result of the activity described in the main clause as in 5c.

- (5) a. I started my meal *before* Adam arrived.
- b. I didn't start my meal *until* Adam arrived.
- c. She massaged her leg *until* it stopped hurting.
- d. *I started my meal *until* Adam arrived. (ibid.)

These examples offer a good overview of the general traditional views of the use of the *until*-clause. But we will see that the general views leave some important cases unexplained. In the next section, a few previous research studies will be presented before turning to the observations of the current study in section 4.

3 . Previous Research

The correct usage of the *until*-clause is hugely dependent on the understanding of durative (or imperfective) clauses. Kittredge (1969 : 45-56) shows whether each example of 6a-d is acceptable on whether the clause is imperfective or perfective. Following Vendler (1967)'s and Smith (1997)'s analysis, *to dance* and *to keep dancing* are 'Activity verb' phrases, and so they are durative, whereas *to stop* is an 'Achievement verb', and so it is non-durative. As long as we look at examples 6a-d, the main clause should be durative (or imperfective), and the *until*-clause should be non-durative (or perfective). It seems that the progressive form *be -ing* is durative (or imperfective), but Kittredge (1969) does not offer an explanation why (6c) is a marginally acceptable sentence.

- (6) a. Alex danced *until* the music stopped.
 S₁(imperfective) S₂(perfective)
- b. Alex kept dancing *until* the music stopped.
 S₁(imperfective) S₂(perfective)

c. (?) Alex was dancing *until* the music stopped.

S₁(imperfective?) S₂(perfective)

d. ?*Alex danced *until* the music was stopping.

S₁(imperfective) S₂(imperfective?) (Kittredge 1969 : 45-56)

(7) Temporal features of the situation types

Situations	Static	Durative	Telic	
Stative	+	+	-	
Activity	-	+	-	
Accomplishment	-	+	+	
Achievement	-	-	+	(Smith 1997 : 20)

Kittredge (1969 : 39) also explains that *to be* in 8 means *to become*, so eventually it is non-durative (perfective).

(8) John soaked the spaghetti until it was soft.

(= John soaked the spaghetti until it became soft.) (Kittredge 1969 : 39)

On the other hand, Heinämäki (1974) argues that the main clause must be durative but he does not say that the *until*-clause is non-durative. Examples 9e-f are not acceptable because the main clauses are not durative, but the verb phrases in the *until*-clauses in 9c-d are durative, meaning Accomplishment, while those in 9a-b, and 9e-f are non-durative. He also says that the reference point given by the *until*-clause marks the end of the interval given by the main clause. So, in 9c, *waiting* lasts up to the moment that John finishes the dishes. That is, the final point of the dish-washing period marks the end of the waiting interval. And in 9d, the *until*-clause defines an interval longer than a moment, and it is the initial point of this interval that marks the end of the story-telling period.

(9) a. We enjoyed camping until mosquitoes showed up.

b. Lydia looked for her teddy bear *until* she found it.

c. We waited *until* Mark washed the dishes.

d. Claire kept telling funny stories *until* Paul was in a good mood.

e. *John built a house *until* he ran out of bricks.

f. *We noticed the bat *until* it took off. (Heinämäki 1974 : 81)

Demizu (2001) points out that there are examples of the *until*-clause including the progressive form, and they are counterexamples to Kittredge's explanation that the *until*-clause is non-durative (or perfective) and Heinämäki's explanation that it marks the end of the interval given by the main clause.

- (10) a. And it was not *until* Margo Posner was being led away that Tyler realized what it was about her that reminded him so much of Kendall.

(S. Sheldon, *Morning, Noon and Night*)

- b. Moving slowly, he inched his entire frame through the opening *until* he was standing in the room. (D. Gram, *Trigger Effect*)

The previous studies give us a good initial analysis. However, they cannot explain why we have the progressive form in the *until*-clause. So the studies of the *until*-clause with the progressive form or the main clause with the progressive form will give light to a new interpretation of the *until*-clause. The meaning of the *until*-clause is formerly divided only into time and result. In the following sections, I will argue that result meaning need to be divided into intentional result and unintentional result. Unless stated otherwise, all the examples below are from the Bank of English.

4 . S₁ (durative) until S₂ (non-durative or durative)

If we see examples from 11a-d to 13a-b, we will think they show every pattern of S₁*until* S₂ clause. And then we tend to conclude that S₂ must be non-durative. But as Demizu (2001) points out, we have the *until*-clause that is not non-durative, and we have no clear way to explain it now.

- (11) a. Alex danced *until* the music stopped.
 S₁ (imperfective/durative) S₂ (perfective/non-durative)
 b. Alex kept dancing *until* the music stopped.
 S₁ (imperfective/durative) S₂ (perfective/non-durative)
 c. (?) Alex was dancing *until* the music stopped.
 S₁(imperfective/durative?) S₂(perfective/non-durative)
 d. ?*Alex danced *until* the music was stopping.
 S₁ (imperfective/durative) S₂ (imperfective/durative?)

(Kittredge 1969 : 45-56)

- (12) a. I started my meal *before* Adam arrived.
 b. I didn't start my meal *until* Adam arrived.
 c. She massaged her leg *until* it stopped hurting.
 d. *I started my meal *until* Adam arrived. (Quirk et al. 1985 : 1081)
- (13) a. They ridiculed him *until* she felt obliged to come to his aid. [result *until*]
 (Quirk 1985 : 1072)
 b. He cleaned his shoes *until* they shone. ('shining is the result of 'cleaning')
 (Hewings 1999 : 188)

4.1 S₁ (durative) until S₂ (durative : progressive)—time

First of all, we will observe the examples of *until*-clauses which include the progressive form.

If we look at the progressive form in the *until*-clause closely, we will find two kinds of meaning. The first one is that the main clause is a negative sentence and the *until*-clause just indicates the time of the action or the situation.

In 14a, he touched me when *he was leaving*, not when *he left*, because it was impossible for him to touch me after he left. In 14b, she had the chance to look up before, but she at last looked up while *I was standing in front of her*. And in 14c he noticed her while *she was standing next to him*. So the progressive form indicates that **something happens during the period**, not before that period. We can perceive that in all three examples the timing of touching me or looking up or noticing her is rather late. The progressive form is used because the situation is going on for a while.

- (14) a. But if he came near me I tensed up inside, my stomach turning over. He never touched me *until he was leaving* when he would kiss me at the door. Immediately I closed the door I started trembling and crying and was very depressed for a couple of days.
- b. She was contemplating the drink as I came over, and didn't look up *until I was standing in front of her and clearing my throat*. Close to, her grubby face looked pale and very young — but I sensed an underlying hardness in her expression : ...
- c. Allen had climbed back to the bridge, and almost immediately the decklights were extinguished, leaving Brunner standing in darkness. He didn't notice her

until she was standing next to him in a bathrobe, a cup of coffee in her hand. "Did it go well?" she asked.

Likewise, in 15a, he had seen the product of his efforts at last *while he was going over the tapes*, and in 15b the subject I put the shirt on *while I was going on the park*, although the timing of my putting the shirt on is rather late. In 15c, the subject I thought about fancying her at last *when she was living with us*, and the subject I realized the timing was rather late. *Fail to do* is equivalent to a negative sentence, so in 15d, one managed to release when the glider was approaching a house, and the timing of releasing was rather late. So again in these examples, the progressive form must be used because its action or state is not finished, and going on for a while.

- (15) a. He had never actually seen the product of his efforts until he was going over the tapes for tomorrow's programme. "But I'll tell you what, it's incredibly entertaining still. Even with a 10-year passage, the atmosphere comes over. "
- b. Rae, 23, said: "I didn't put the shirt on until I was going on the park and, as soon as I did, I noticed it smelled of perfume. It was a bit embarrassing. "
- c. My youngest daughter's best friend has been a regular visitor to our home for years. I've always had a soft spot for her but didn't even think about fancying her until she was living with us last summer while her parents were in Australia.
- d. Occasionally one or both legs would hang up ; one failed to release until the glider was approaching a house where a wedding party was engaged in a photographic sortie in the garden.

We have the *it was not until ... that* pattern as in 16a-c, and these are negative sentences. So also in this case the progressive form indicates that something happens during the period, not before that period. This pattern focuses more on the timing of realizing, and indicates that the timing of realizing is too late.

- (16) a. It was this toughness thing — if you became a Para you'd never be frightened or back down from a confrontation. I had friends who were Paras and I looked up to them. It wasn't until *I was lying under a barrage of shells in the Falklands* that it really dawned on me that being in the Army meant going to war.
- b. It wasn't until *Joni was going through therapy with Dr Britten's assistant*,

Rana, that she learned the whole story of Vicky's life.

- c. He hastily returned his gown to the cloakroom and set off across the dark courtyard. It was not until *he was approaching the archway* that he remembered the lovely woman. He stopped. But it was too late now.

So we can say that one type of the *until*-clause including the progressive form is that it means time — precisely speaking, a short period of time. And so the progressive form is quite natural.

4.2 S₁ (durative : wait) until S₂ (nondurative or durative)—time

Let's observe *wait until ...* construction next. The *until*-clause in this construction is another case of meaning time, not result.

As the examples 17a-d and 18a-i show, *wait until ...* construction means that *to wait for the right time to do something*. The purpose of waiting for the right time is described by the *before*-phrase or the *before*-clause in 17b and 18a-e, and the following clause in 17a and 18f-h, and *to infinitive* in 18i, each of which is underlined.

- (17) a. Autumn wanted Lonnie to have the money, but he was a proud man, so she had waited until the moment seemed right. She rose and gazed at him in the moonlight. "I've been thinking."
- b. Mao waited until he judged the time right before resuming the revolutionary lead.
- c. I was nearly 38 and aware that if I waited until he felt right about it, it would be too late. I felt really rejected by Charles's refusal to have children. The longer we were married, the clearer it became that he hadn't thought about having children at all.
- d. Two friends of mine who spent their twenties and early thirties forging a career and taking precautions NOT to get pregnant, have encountered problems now they are ready for the big event. They did the 'sensible' thing and waited until the emotional and financial time was right, and now find themselves looking enviously at the young, careerless mums who got pregnant when the physical time was right. They are both having time-consuming, frustrating, and crippling expensive IVF treatment. Its success relies a great deal on the quality of eggs the woman produces.

- (18) a. He waited until Hooke died before publishing his Opticks in 1704, when he could safely have the last word.
- b. Ferguson waited until his team hit top spot before replying to the Arsenal manager's remarks. The United boss said : "He always has a comment to make."
- c. We waited until we had our own home before having children and decided the time was right two years ago but my girlfriend didn't get pregnant straight away.
- d. We waited until I hit my target last September before going to Greece on our honeymoon.
- e. President Collor waited until everything was ready for him to be tried in the Brazilian Senate before he had his spokesman read an unexpected announcement last night.
- f. Early-warning radars could pick up the V-1s about 100 miles away. Ground controllers waited until the flying bombs were about half a mile behind the planes, then ordered the pilots to intercept.
- g. S.B. says his son waited behind the pallets until the soldiers were gone, then ran to the house of a neighbor, a Serb whom he trusted.
- h. "I didn't want it, I absolutely didn't. He had really been so horrible and I didn't want him to hurt me." Andrews said she ran from the room and waited until he was asleep. She got his cricket bat 'in case he hurt me any more'.
- i. Then they waited until Mary and Brian left their pub to join hundreds of mourners at nearby Carmelite Friary.

So, in the case of examples 19a-b, *she looked (round) at someone* is the right time, and then made an utterance, and unlike examples 20a-c, there followed no staring or glaring. On the other hand, in the case of the *until*-clause with the progressive form as in 20a-c, the right time was not a particular time, but a particular period, so the progressive form is used. We can see that the situation is going on for a while because *glaring back at me* or *staring at me* followed in 20a-b. Also in 20c we can see that the situation of *everyone looking the other way* continued.

- (19) a. She turned away from me at last and found a pack of cigarettes and puffed smoke up into the air. "Erica," I said and waited until she looked at me. "I need your help. That's why I asked if I could spend the night here. But I can't tell you

in front of him.”

b. “Then why are you still here?” Ryan asked, stubbing out his cigarette. “Thanks, Larry.” Katherine said, crossing to the door. “Oh, and Katy?” Ryan waited until she looked round at him. “Merry Christmas.” I’ve got a feeling it will be.” Katherine said with a knowing smile as she closed the door behind her.

- (20) a. And on one occasion I waited until he was looking at me and I took my hat off and planted it on the desk in front glared at him. *He glared back at me.*
- b. But it’s better fun to tell the truth, when it can’t hurt, and is bound to cause devilment. So I said : “No, my lord. I’m sure your decision is correct.” I waited until he was looking at me to see that I meant it, and then added : “But in your position, I’d not burn the Summer Palace.” *He stared at me, frowning.*
- c. This is your chance. Nancy told herself, and it might be the only one you’ll get. “There it is!” she shouted, and waited until everyone was looking the other way. Then she turned and raced along the beach toward the speedboats.

In conclusion, the *until*-clause with the progressive form means two types of time : (i) *not ... until* type : something happens during a short period of time (meaning it’s late or too late). (ii) *wait until* type : wait for the right period of time to come. Example 21 is clearly not the type of time.

- (21) ?*Alex danced *until* the music was stopping. (= (11d))
 S₁ (imperfective/durative) S₂ (imperfective/durative?) (cf. Kittredge 1969)

Demizu (2002) gives the following examples and explains that I waited longer in 22a than in 22b, because I had to wait until a little after it began raining. As explained above, and in this construction *to hit a bank* is the purpose of *my waiting*, and so *I waited for the right period of time (it was raining) to come*. So example 22a implies that I waited until it was raining, and then hit a bank *while it was raining*. So Demizu’s explanation may be right, but we cannot get a good picture of the whole sentence. So example 23 is a good sentence itself, but preferably the purpose should be added in some way.

- (22) a. I waited *until* it was raining, and then hit a bank.
 (S. Sheldon, *Rage of Angels*)
- b. I waited *until* it started raining, and then hit a bank. [Demizu 2002]

(23) We waited *until* Mark washed the dishes. (= (9c))

(Heinämäki 1974)

4.3 S₁ (durative) until S₂ (non-durative or durative) — result

The second type of the *until*-clause construction is that it means result (that is, the ultimate point of the main clause situation). If we look at the following *until he was standing* clauses, his standing position changed from someplace to *in the rain* in 24a, *in front of Christian* in 24b, *one step above Lynch* in 24c, *below the window* in 24d or *in the middle of a sea of waving fists and protests* in 24e as a result of moving forward or the crowds coming around him. And the progressive form not only indicates that the position still continued after that, but also the *until*-clause with the progressive form focuses on the exact description of the subject. Unlike the case of time, we can paraphrase this result case of S₁ *until* S₂ as S₁ *and* S₂.

- (24) a. ...the knob slowly, then quickly pulled the door open just enough for him to squeeze through, and pulled it closed quietly behind him. He walked a few paces away from the door until he was standing in the rain, then turned on his flashlight and...
- b. Philippe was in uniform, wearing a pistol holster on his belt as though he were on duty. He bowed towards them all then smiled grimly at her and walked quickly forward until he was standing in front of Christian. Christian pushed himself to his feet as Philippe held out his hand. Christian shook it briefly, his face expressionless.
- c. "Sir!" cried the man. "May I help you?" He made his way down the stairs until he was standing one step above Lynch. "I couldn't help but overhear your conversation," he said. "You wanted to speak with Hank, didn't you?"
- d. ...he hauled himself back up on to the porch and inched his way along the wall until he was standing beside the window. He was about to remove one of the stun grenades from his belt when he heard the sound of the front door being unlocked from inside the house.
- e. ...the cry was taken up by those around him until it spread throughout the crowds. Chants of "Pull It Down # Pull It Down # Pull It Down!" began to ring around Schumacher until he was standing in the middle of a sea of waving fists and protest. He let it build for a while, before waving his arms to quieten them.

Unlike the case of the *until*-clause with the progressive form, the *until*-clause with the simple tense as in 25a-d means that the action is finished, so there follows another action. Each of the second action in 25a-d is underlined. In this case, even if the subject of the main clause intentionally or unintentionally does something, the *until*-clause simply shows its result.

- (25) a. On one wall was a series of paintings — Tibetan, Rik Stevens Cexplained — all variations on a theme. She stepped onto the futon, approached him until she stood immediately in front of him. “Kneel,” he commanded. She did so.
- b. How could she have been so stupid, so utterly blind to the truth? “Yeah, I’m the one who told on you,” he agreed. He sauntered slowly across the room until he stood on the far side of the desk from her. He glanced down at the open scrapbook. “Oh, you didn’t finish. Turn the page.”
- c. He asked me when I’d last had sex. I said : “That’s a bit personal.” Then he went to undo his trousers and walked around the coffee table until he stood in front of me. I said : “I’m not really comfortable with this. Would you mind if we went upstairs?” He walked up in front of me.
- d. Oracle gestured impatiently and pushed through the throng until she stood at the visitor’s side. “Why do you come, ome, ome, ome.” she said in her echo voice, the one that sounded as though it came from a limitless cavern, far far underground.

In 26a-c, the subject I or she resulted in *living in a slum or with other group members*. All of these examples are just (unintentional) results, and the *until*-clause with the progressive form focuses on the exact description of the subject and means that the situation continues for a while. Also In 26d, she was in the state of *going crazy*, as a result of my rejecting and hurting her, and the state still continued for a while after that. So this is also the case of an unintentional result, and we can paraphrase it as *I had rejected her and hurt her and she was going crazy*. In 26e, however, we cannot tell whether the subject intentionally or unintentionally pressed her to the point of *her lying flat on the grass*.

- (26) a. Nothing seemed worthwhile, and I am afraid that I let the household chores slide day after day until I was living in a slum. And how slowly the time passed.
- b. “She suggested that I go with her to her church, the International Church of

- Christ, which I did because I was feeling lonely,” says Sarah, now 31. Once there, she was drawn into an ever deeper involvement, until she was living with other group members who controlled her every movement, including what she wore, ate, read and when she went to sleep.
- c. “I had no money worries until 1993.” There was no huge extravagance but his overheads increased until he was living in New York with a \$400,000 mortgage and a very expensive recording studio inside the apartment. Then it all dried up.
- d. “I just think there’s a lot of external factors. Let’s say I had rejected her and hurt her until she was going crazy. You know? But I don’t think it’s a malicious kind of thing.” And yet he did file a complaint, and he claims to still be scared.
- e. He proved his point by leaning over to kiss her, pressing her back until she was lying flat on the grass. Entering into the spirit of her laughter he began by kissing her lightly, decorously, before moving to lie more closely beside her.

We have the clear cases of unintentional result : that is, *until suddenly*, *until eventually*, *until finally* patterns as in 27a-f. We sometimes find comma (,) before the *until*-clause as in 27b, 27d, and 27f. These *until*-clauses can be paraphrased as the ... *and* ... construction.

- (27) a. Just before I went to sleep, my mother said : “I’ll wake you up in the morning when the time comes.” I lay awake with excitement that night until suddenly **Mama was standing over me.**
- b. I watched him swing, once, twice, three times, steadily gaining height, until suddenly he was flying through the air, spinning and tumbling with such speed that for a moment he refracted into pure light, a white and silvery blur, as if I was seeing him...
- c. This glorious Garrick Club codger provided a running commentary of outrage, addressed to no one in particular, but gathering momentum until, eventually, he was shouting at the actors on stage.
- d. I worked as a lingerie buyer, then as a business analyst, before joining Reed Exhibition Company in 1986. At first I worked on about seven or eight events, until eventually I was running 17 shows.
- e. Since he appeared to enjoy the time out of the apartment and began to anticipate those days, she allowed us to send him more often until finally he was

attending full days five days a week.

- f. Les Guignols ran a sketch with Lescure describing Canal's 'simple' structure; he kept climbing higher and higher — on to his desk, up an elevator — to add pieces to the organisational chart, until finally he was floating in a spaceship saying: "See, it's all very simple and clear."

Examples 28a-d have the *until...almost* pattern, and *almost* clearly implies that the *until*-clause indicates result — *almost* is the ultimate point of the situation, which the emphasis lies on. And the examples are the cases of intentional result, because the subject intentionally does something until he or she reaches the intended point, and the focus only lies on the result — the ultimate point of situation and it continues for a short period of time.

- (28) a. Then, when you are ready, raise your hands with the palms facing each other about twelve inches apart. Start to bring your palms together slowly until they are almost touching.
- b. Finish the sequence by speeding up the contractions and making them smaller and smaller, until your mouth corners are almost shaking.
- c. Julie held the joint out to Autumn, but quickly withdrew her hand. "I forgot. You never touch the stuff. It destroys motivation." Julie leaned until her nose was almost touching Autumn's.
- d. Now Burke was moving down the catwalk, away from the cooler, back to the spiral staircase. Reaching out to take Mary Ann's hand, he quickened his pace until they were almost running.

In conclusion, the *until*-clause including the progressive form also means unintentional or intentional result. In the case of intentional result, the *until*-clause indicates the ultimate degree of some situation and it usually include *almost* or other kinds of degree. Example 29 has no meaning of intentional or unintentional result.

- (29) ?*Alex danced *until* the music was stopping. (= (11d))
 S₁ (imperfective/durative) S₂ (imperfective/durative?) (cf. Kittredge 1969)

5. S₁ (progressive) until S₂ (non-durative)

5.1 S₁ (progressive) until S₂ (non-durative)—time

In this section I want to explore the meaning of S_1 (progressive) until S_2 (non-durative) and would like to explain why example 30 is marginally acceptable.

(30) (?) Alex was dancing *until* the music stopped. (= (11c)) (Kittredge 1969)

This type of the *until*-clause originally indicates time, so we find many instances of time as in 31a-f. But we also find other kinds of examples in 32a-b, the meaning of which is described in 5.2.

- (31) a. We were singing and dancing **until gone 1am** then June and I went to bed
 b. They continued dancing **until the early hours** yesterday and looked
 c. that behind her they would go on singing and dancing **until daylight**. It was the warmest
 d. Rave, Garage and Techno kept everybody dancing **until breakfast time** and the night
 e. mckee, who's recently found herself dancing **until dawn** and writing erotic novels,
 f. Ecstasy to enjoy themselves and go on dancing **until nine o'clock in the morning** ;
- (32) a. Clubbers just go on dancing until they literally drop dead of dehydration.
 b. Boob said and she kept dancing until she finally collapsed on the floor.

The most frequent case of this construction is *going well until ...* pattern, as in 33. We find 45 examples of them in the Bank of English. We also find examples of *going brilliantly/fine/OK/smoothly/swimmingly /until ...* pattern, or *doing fine/well until ...* pattern as in 34. This is the case of time, not result, because *going well* does not lead to the content of the *until*-clause. *Something is going well* until a particular time, and an unexpected thing happens at that time. The *until*-clause indicates there is some happening there and it prevents *something from going well*. We can find a lot of happenings in the *until*-clauses of 33 and 34.

- (33) mutt and his deception was **going well** until the replacement pet got wet. Then to the right. All was **going well** until he was just moments from his front door.

Things were **going well until** I found out my husband is behaving as if he is our relationship was **going well until** I returned home from work unexpectedly David Thompson and it was **going well until** I asked for a couple of clauses. We and Kieren Fallon were **going well until** they parted company on the bottom DONNA PATON'S diet was **going well...until** she moved into a caravan. Then the we had dinner. All was **going well until** the coffee was served (tea made for the course and all was **going well until** we approached what looked like a Crummet felt all was **going well until** something odd happened. The court- All the building work was **going well until** they uncovered a huge nest of ants

- (34) ngland player was **going brilliantly—until** my new mates started calling me MAR The interview was **going brilliantly until** I glanced down and noticed blood li Disgusted. 'Everything was **going fine until** the woman told me. Congratulations she said. 'Everything was **going fine until** the car went into the water and was few days and everything was **going fine until** we got that train. The conductor sa bs recently. Everything was **going fine until** they read the address on my licence to this. Everything was **going OK until** he asked if I would object if he wo atings said : "Everything was **going OK until** the word 'arse' was blurted out from year everything was **going smoothly until** he ran up a seven at the 10th er. Everything was **going smoothly until** he found out that the children the tills. All was **going swimmingly until** one brave individual pulled the coa here. The evening was **going swimmingly until** the wine buff on my left urged me a double-decker bus? He was **doing fine until** someone rang the bell and he stoppe looking dim &hellip ; I was **doing fine until** a man called me a monkey. I was you found a good job, and was **doing well until** anonymous phone calls to the manage went into business. She was **doing well until** the country was hit be the present

We can also find similar patterns in 35a-i, and also a lot of happenings occur in the *until*-clauses.

- (35) a. He was **getting better until** he picked up an infection during the summer.
 b. The graduate in speech communications and psychology was **looking good until** he crossed paths with a lift in California.
 c. Sure, he was a fake, but he'd found something real to tap into, and everything was **working fine until** he ran into another trauma tourist, the appalling Marla,

- chain-smoking even at the TB support group.
- d. The introduction of Calum Giles and the recall of Rob Thompson was looking good **until** England were woefully outplayed in two games in the Netherlands 10 days ago.
- e. Everything was **progressing swimmingly until** desserts and coffee were called for.
- f. I was **feeling OK until** I got in the break.
- g. “A wonderful evening”, I am always convinced that the critic wrote : “I was **having a wonderful evening until** I sank to the neck in this quagmire of theatrical goose poo.”
- h. Richard’s brand-new motor cruiser was **running beautifully, until** disaster struck.
- i. Mardon picked up the knock in a pre-season friendly and was **recovering well until** the knee gave way as he got out of bed

Exmaples 36a-d are not examples of *going smoothly*, but the situation continues until a particular time. So these are not typical examples, but should be included in this pattern.

- (36) a. Twenty-five years ago, he was a young conscript doing his national service in the Yugoslav army. Soon afterwards he emigrated and was **working until** the war started as a building contractor, putting together homes in The Hamptons for the likes of pop star Billy Joel.
- b. and I had packed ourselves into the car, heading for I-5. I was **smiling—until** I noticed the lineup to merge onto the freeway.
- c. The newspaperman was **disbelieving until** Maupassant smiled and said, “Look at my trousers.” A suicide attempt on January 2, 1892, was unsuccessful.
- d. The trouble was that my brain was humming and it made coherent thoughts difficult. The hum was **increasing until** I realized it came from the sky.

5.2 S₁ (progressive) until S₂ (non-durative)—unintentional result

We also find examples of the *until*-clause meaning result (that is, the ultimate point) of the main clause situation—unintentional result. We can sometimes find comma (,) before the *until*-clause.

- (37) a. And with each layer I peeled, the monster was getting smaller, **until finally** ...

he was sort of a Muppet-type monster, kind of big and fuzzy ferocious but no longer vicious.

b. During the night Hawker noticed that the radiator temperature was rising dangerously until it reached 176.F.

c. Even Chrysler became sick, as a Japanese nameplate invasion was mounting, until a \$1.5 billion federal bailout loan was made on Nov. 1, 1979.

d. The manufacturing and services business was sinking until John Parker took the helm—now it is making healthy profits.

(38) a. Clubbers just go on dancing until they literally drop dead of dehydration.(= (32))

b. Boob said and she kept dancing until she finally collapsed on the floor.

In conclusion, in this construction of the main clause including the progressive form, the *until*-clause means time (there occurred some happening) or (unintentional) result (the ultimate point of the main clause). But in 39 *the music stopped* is not considered as the ultimate point of dancing. So we have to think of it as some happening. But it is not easy to regard *the music stopped* as some happening while dancing because the music usually stops in a dance, and then it is marked as questionable.

(39) (?) Alex was dancing *until* the music stopped. (= (11c)) (Kittredge 1969)

6. S₁ (durative) until S₂ (non-durative)—time and (intentional or unintentional) result

We still have some basic examples unexplained. Examples 40a-b, 41a, 43a and 43c are the cases of time. Some situation continues until a particular time, that is, it continues for a period of time but it stops at a particular time. Example 43c is an example of the *wait until ...* construction, meaning 'to wait for the right time to do something.'

Examples 41b, 42, 43b and 44a-b do not mean time, but intentional result. In that case, the subject of the main clause intentionally does something and stops it when he or she accomplishes it, *massaging her leg* in 41b, and *soaking the spaghetti* in 42, and *looking for her teddy bear* in 43b, *ridiculing him or cleaning his shoes* in 44a-b.

(40) a. I disliked Maurice *until* I got to know him. (= (4))

- b. The children were noisy *until* told to be quiet. (Quirk et al. 1985 : 1081)
- (41) a. I didn't start my meal *until* Adam arrived. (= (5b))
 b. She massaged her leg *until* it stopped hurting. (= (5c))
 c. *I started my meal *until* Adam arrived. (= (5d))(ibid.)
- (42) a. John soaked the spaghetti until it was soft. (= (8))
 (= John soaked the spaghetti until it became soft.) (Kittredge 1969 : 39)
- (43) a. We enjoyed camping until mosquitoes showed up. (= (9))
 b. Lydia looked for her teddy bear *until* she found it.
 c. We waited *until* Mark washed the dishes.
 d. Claire kept telling funny stories *until* Paul was in a good mood.
 e. *John built a house *until* he ran out of bricks.
 f. *We noticed the bat *until* it took off (Heinämäki 1974 : 81)
- (44) a. They ridiculed him *until* she felt obliged to come to his aid.[result *until*]
 (= (13a)) (Quirk 1985 : 1072)
 b. He cleaned his shoes *until* they shone. ('shining' is the result of 'cleaning')
 (= (13b)) (Hewings 1999 : 188)

Examples 45a is also the case of **unintentional result**, that is, some speaking situation continues in the main clause, and, as a result, someone utters a sentence in the end. In this case there is some relation between the happening in the main clause and the utterance in the *until*-clause. So the *until*-clause indicates the result of a preceding event. In 45b, they take turns speaking and in the end each has said all he or she cares to say. We can paraphrase this result case of S_1 *until* S_2 as S_1 *and* S_2 . In 45c-d he pursued marrying her or her staying and in the end she was compelled to say yes. But these cases just show result.

- (45) a. She sounded as if she were trying to sing though weeping and strangling. She did not pause or stop to end the embarrassment. She kept going until she said the last word, and then she sat down.
 b. Absolutely no interruptions are allowed. Turns continue until each has said all that he or she cares to say.
 c. She explained that she never paid much attention to her husband when she met him in high school, but he pursued her until she said "yes."
 d. He begged her not to go. He pleaded with her until she said she would stay.

So we can conclude that the normal pattern of S_1 (durative) *until* S_2 (non-durative), which does not include the progressive form, means three kinds : time and unintentional or intentional result. So we can explain the difference of meaning between 46a and 46b clearly. In 46a the subject intentionally cleaned his shoes for the purpose of shining it and, as a result, the shoes shone, but we don't care whether his shoes were still shining now, while in 46b the subject intentionally waxed the floor for the purpose of cleaning it to the ultimate degree of the floor shining, and we can perceive the floor shining now.

- (46) a. He cleaned his shoes *until* they shone. = (13b)(Hewings 1999 : 188)
 b. Sam waxed the floor *until* it was shining. (Heinämäki 1974)

Examples 47a-b are difficult to tell whether they are the case of intentional result or unintentional result. In 47b, however, whether it is the case of intentional result or unintentional result, the ultimate point is that *they were both lying on the grass*, and the following conversation was clearly made *while they were both lying*.

- (47) a. He went down like a tree and I knelt up on him and smashed him back and forth across the face with my elbow, back and forth more times than I needed *until he lay still*, eyes rolled up, broken jaw sagging open against the wool of his bloody ski mask. I turned to Alice. She was lying on the couch, weeping helplessly. "Did he attack you?" I knew the signs. She was traumatized almost out of her mind. But she shook her head.
 b. He leaned across and kissed her on the lips, pressing her back *until they were both lying* on the grass. "I really am sorry, Trish. I love you, you know that." "Not enough," said Trish, struggling with a wish to cry.

7. Conclusion

In conclusion the *until*-clause with the progressive form means two types of time : (i) *not ... until* type : something happens during a short period of time, and it is used when we regret the timing is rather late. (ii) *wait until* type : wait for the right period of time to come. And the *until*-clause including the progressive form also means two types of result: unintentional result and intentional result. At least *the music was stopping* is regarded as neither time nor the result of dancing, and then example 48a is a strange sentence. And the

affirmative construction with the meaning of time is only *wait until ...* pattern as in 48b.

(48) a. ?*Alex danced *until* the music was stopping. (= (11d))

S₁ (imperfective/durative) S₂ (imperfective/durative?) (Kittredge 1969)

b. And on one occasion I waited until he was looking at me and I took my hat off and planted it on the desk in front glared at him. *He glared back at me.* (= (20a))

As for the main clause including the progressive form, the *until*-clause means time (there occurred some happening) or (unintentional) result (the ultimate point of the main clause). But in 49a *the music stopped* is not considered as the ultimate point of dancing as in 49b-c. So we have to think of it as some happening. But it is not easy to regard *the music stopped* as some happening while dancing, and then it is marked as questionable. The typical pattern of this construction is that *everything is going well/smoothly until ...*

(49) a. (?) Alex was dancing *until* the music stopped. (= (11d)) (Kittredge 1969)

b. Clubbers just go on dancing until they literally drop dead of dehydration.
(= (32a))

c. Boob said and she kept dancing until she finally collapsed on the floor.
(= (32b))

The S₁ *until* S₂ pattern without the progressive form in either S₁ or S₂ also means time and (unintentional or intentional) result. When the pattern means result, the subject of the main clause does something (and accomplishes it), and the next situation follows, but the *until*-clause including the progressive form does something for the purpose of doing it to the ultimate degree or the intended point and the resulting situation continues for a while. The *wait until ...* construction again means 'to wait for the right time to do something.'

*I'd like to thank Pernilla Daniellson in the University of Birmingham for her helpful comments on this paper.

【References】

- Araki, K et al. 1977. *Jodoshi(Auxiliaries)* (Gendai no eibunpo 9) Tokyo : Kenkyusha.
- Demizu, T. 2001. "Until-setsu-nai no doushi no asupekuto to kaishaku" *Studies in English Grammar and Usage* 8, 141-155.
- . 2002. "Until-setsu-nai no doushiku no shinkokei to joutaisei" *Rokkor Eigogaku Kenkyu* 5, 53-71.
- . 2003. "Until-setsu-nai no ichi · shisei wo arawasu doushiku" *Rokkor Eigogaku Kenkyu* 6, 83-98.
- Declerck, R. 1981. "On the Role of Progressive Aspect in Nonfinite Perception Verb Complements." *Glossa* 15, 83-114.
- Depraetere, I. 1995. "On the Necessity of Distinguishing between (Un)boundedness and (A)telicity." *Linguistics and Philosophy* 18, 1-19.
- Heinämäki, O. 1974. "Semantics of English Temporal Connectives." Indiana University Linguistics Club.
- Hewings, M. 1999. *Advanced English Grammar in Use* (2nd ed.) Cambridge : Cambridge University Press
- Kittredge, R. I. 1969. "Tense, Aspect, and Conjunction : Some Inter-Relations for English." Ph. D. dissertation, University of Pennsylvania. University Microfilms.
- Kinugasa, T. 2005. "Until-setsu ni okeru shinkokei." *Studies in English Grammar and Usage* 12, 95-109.
- Quirk, R. et al. 1985. *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language*. London : Longman
- Sinclair, J. 1992. *Collins COBUILD English Usage*. Glasgow : HarperCollins.
- Smith, C.S. 1997. *The Parameter of Aspect*. (2nd ed.) Dordrecht : Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Swan, M. 2005. *Practical English Usage*. (3rd ed.) London : OUP.
- Uchikiba, T. 2004. 'Kodawari'no Eigogoho Kenkyu. Tokyo : Kaitakusha
- . "Until to shinkokei — Kinugasa (2005) heno hanron" *Rokkor Eigogaku Kenkyu* 8/9, 1-15
- Vendler, Z. 1967. *Linguistics in Philosophy*. Ithaca : Cornell University Press.

【2008年9月22日受付、10月31日受理】